Ocean dynamics, not dust, have controlled equatorial Pacific productivity over the past 500,000 years

Gisela Winckler\textsuperscript{a,b,1}, Robert F. Anderson\textsuperscript{a,b}, Samuel L. Jaccard\textsuperscript{c,d}, and Franco Marcantonioc

\textsuperscript{a}Lamont-Doherty Earth Observatory, Columbia University, Palisades, NY 10964; \textsuperscript{b}Department of Earth and Environmental Sciences, Columbia University, New York, NY 10027; \textsuperscript{c}Institute of Geological Sciences, University of Bern, 3012 Bern, Switzerland; \textsuperscript{d}Oeschger Center for Climate Change Research, University of Bern, 3012 Bern, Switzerland; and \textsuperscript{e}Department of Geology and Geophysics, Texas A&M University, College Station, TX 77843

Edited by Edward A. Boyle, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge, MA, and approved April 8, 2016 (received for review January 13, 2016)

Biological productivity in the equatorial Pacific is relatively high compared with other low-latitude regimes, especially east of the dateline, where divergence driven by the trade winds brings nutrient-rich waters of the Equatorial Undercurrent to the surface. The equatorial Pacific is one of the three principal high-nutrient low-chlorophyll ocean regimes where biological utilization of nitrate and phosphate is limited, in part, by the availability of iron. Throughout most of the equatorial Pacific, upwelling of water from the Equatorial Undercurrent supplies far more dissolved iron than is delivered by dust, by as much as two orders of magnitude. Nevertheless, recent studies have inferred that the greater supply of dust during ice ages stimulated greater utilization of nutrients within the region of upwelling on the equator, thereby contributing to the sequestration of carbon in the ocean interior. Here we present proxy records for dust and for biological productivity over the past 500 ky at three sites spanning the breadth of the equatorial Pacific Ocean to test the dust fertilization hypothesis. Dust supply peaked under glacial conditions, consistent with previous studies, whereas proxies of export production exhibit maxima during ice age terminations. Temporal decoupling between dust supply and biological productivity indicates that other factors, likely involving ocean dynamics, played a greater role than dust in regulating equatorial Pacific productivity.

Significance

The equatorial Pacific is a key oceanographic region in Earth’s climate system. Biological productivity in this region is limited, in part, by the lack of the micronutrient iron. Atmospheric dust is a source of iron, as is upwelling of ocean waters from below. A longstanding question has been whether biological productivity has responded to variable dust supply over ice age cycles. We use geochemical proxies in three sediment cores spanning the breadth of the equatorial Pacific to show that biological productivity did not respond to dustier ice age conditions. Rather than atmospheric iron supply, we infer that ocean dynamics, linking the equatorial Pacific to nutrient supply from the Southern Ocean, played a crucial role in regulating equatorial Pacific productivity.

Supporting Information

Dust fluxes are consistently about 2.5 times larger at peak glacial conditions than during interglacial periods (19, 20).

Whereas Baxs accumulation rates show variability of a factor of 2 at each of the sites, we do not observe systematically greater export production during glacial periods. Accumulation rates of Baxs are not correlated with dust flux (Fig. 2; for scatter plots, see Fig. S2). Given that we do not observe a systematic response of export production to greater ice age dust supply of sulfur, we reject the dust fertilization hypothesis for the equatorial Pacific.

The lack of a productivity response to changing dust fluxes is consistent with our understanding of the Fe budget in the present-day equatorial Pacific. Iron may be supplied to the euphotic zone from advective and diffusive processes within the ocean as well as by atmospheric deposition of mineral dust to the ocean surface. Iron contribution by upwelling (Fig. 3, Fig. S3, and Supporting Information) is found to be consistently much higher than eolian-derived Fe contributions, identifying upwelling from the Equatorial Undercurrent (EUC) as the principal source of Fe to the surface waters across most of the equatorial Pacific (24–26). Iron supply from upwelling is a factor of 20–100 greater thanolian sources for much of the central/eastern equatorial Pacific centered around site TT013-PC72 at 140°W (−160°W to 115°W). In the western equatorial Pacific (−160°E), where eolian input is higher, and at the eastern end of our transect (110°W), where dissolved Fe concentrations are lower, Fe input from upwelling is about a factor of 7–10 higher than eolian supply. Possible changes in the upwelling source or rate, as a result of changing ocean circulation, are therefore more likely to impact dissolved Fe supply to the surface ocean than the recorded 2.5-fold increase in dust-bound Fe deposition during glacial periods.

The dominant control on Fe supply by upwelling rather than dust holds true for past climates, as shown by the lack of a correlation (r = 0.11, P = 0.16, Fig. S4) between δ18O and the accumulation rate of Fe (27) at TT013-PC72. Further support comes from the Fe/Th record at core TT013-PC72 (Fig. 3). Bulk sediment Fe/Th ratios are closely correlated to the 232Th flux (Fig. 3B) and show cyclical variability between typical crustal Fe/Th ratios (~3,200 (28)) at maximum glacial conditions, when eolian input was the highest, and increased Fe/Th ratios during interglacial times. The enriched Fe/Th ratio requires an additional Fe source independent from eolian input, and we interpret this source to be upwelled dissolved Fe from the EUC, with a possible contribution from Papua New Guinea (PNG) volcanics carried eastward across the equatorial Pacific.

At TT013-PC72, multiple linear regression modeling of trace element and isotope data shows an upper limit for the contribution to total lithogenic deposition from PNG volcanics of 30% during the Holocene, and a much lower contribution during the Last Glacial Maximum and earlier glacial stages (29). In the following, we consider two limiting end-member scenarios to estimate the supply of Fe by upwelling (Fig. 3C and Supporting Information). For a constant maximum PNG lithogenic input, the best fit to the 500-ky time series Fe and Th data at 140°W requires a source of dissolved Fe from upwelling of 117 ± 7 μmol·m−2·y−1. Assuming no PNG supply of lithogenic material, the best fit corresponds to 167 ± 8 μmol·m−2·y−1. This sediment-based estimated range of dissolved Fe from upwelling by the EUC (Fig. 3C) is consistent with the modern hydrographic constraints of Fe upwelling (gray box at 140°W in Fig. 3A) and provides independent support for upwelling rather than dust as the dominant control on Fe supply in the equatorial Pacific.

The main feature in the record of export production across the equatorial Pacific is repeated increases in export productivity centered at glacial terminations (I, II, and IV; Figs. 4 and 2). Deglacial productivity maxima are consistent with previously observed peaks in opal flux at glacial terminations in the central equatorial Pacific (23) and similar findings, based on diatom/cocolithophore ratios (30) and carbon burial rates (31) in the eastem most equatorial Pacific.

Phytoplankton growth and utilization of nitrate (NO3) and phosphate (PO4) in the equatorial Pacific are colimited by Fe and Si (32). Most of the Fe and all of the macronutrients (N, P, and Si) supplied to equatorial Pacific phytoplankton are delivered by upwelling of nutrient-rich water from the EUC. Therefore, the deglacial productivity maxima must reflect either an increase in the nutrient content of EUC water or an increase in the rate at which EUC water is upwelled into the euphotic zone.

Is there any evidence for increased nutrient concentrations of the EUC during the deglaciation? Most of the nutrients that fuel biological productivity in the tropical oceans, including the equatorial Pacific, originate in the Southern Ocean, where a portion of the nutrient-rich deep water that upwells south of the Antarctic Polar Front (APF) mixes northward to be entrained into Subantarctic Mode Water (SAMW), thereby feeding the upper thermocline nutrient source to low latitudes (33, 34). A southward displacement of the southern westerly winds, thought to have been responsible for the deglacial increase in upwelling of deep water south of the APF (35), would also have raised the nutrient content of SAMW based on historical observations (36). Silicon isotope records from core sites in the New Zealand sector of the Southern Ocean indicate higher nutrient concentrations in the SAMW source regions during the last deglaciation (37). At sites in the easternmost equatorial Pacific, east of 90°W, a deglacial peak in the nutrient content of EUC water during the last three ice age terminations has been inferred from the carbon and Si isotope composition of foraminifera from the same site indicates an increase in supply of Southern Ocean water to the EUC coincident with the rise in nutrient concentration (40).

Support for increased rates of upwelling during deglacial periods of greater export production, concurrently with a rise in the nutrient content of EUC water, comes from observations of the spatial and temporal variability of sea surface temperature at eastern equatorial Pacific sites (31, 41). Similarly, the nitrogen isotope composition of sedimentary organic matter in the eastern equatorial Pacific indicates a deglacial minimum in nitrate utilization coinciding with maximum export production.
a situation that requires an increase in supply of nutrients by upwelling (42).

The evidence for both increased nutrient content and increased upwelling is limited to observations from sites in the easternmost equatorial Pacific; unfortunately, corresponding proxy records are not available for our sites. Nevertheless, as the EUC supplies a uniform source of water, corresponding to uniform forcing throughout the upwelling system, we infer that the changes presented above for the easternmost equatorial Pacific likely extended to the entire central and eastern equatorial Pacific. Consequently, both factors, increased nutrient content of EUC water as well as increased rates of upwelling, likely contributed to the deglacial maxima in export production.

Although upwelled nutrients are not used immediately in the equatorial Pacific, they are eventually consumed completely and exported to depth as organic matter as surface waters mix poleward. Consequently, the biological pump in the equatorial Pacific is operating at full efficiency when integrated over appropriate temporal and spatial scales (15, 43). Neither natural variability of Fe sources in the past nor purposeful addition of Fe to equatorial Pacific surface water today, proposed as a mechanism for mitigating the anthropogenic increase in atmospheric CO₂ inventory, would have a significant impact on atmospheric pCO₂.

Materials and Methods

Reconstruction of Dust Supply. We use common thorium (²³²Th, red), a trace element enriched in continental crust and low in basaltic volcanic material, as a tracer for lithogenic material, which, for cores far enough away from the continental margins, exclusively reflects eolian dust supply (19, 44). As ²³²Th has very similar concentrations in dust sources from around the world, we...
convert to dust mass fluxes by dividing by the average $^{232}$Th concentration of upper continental crust (UCC), 10.7 ppm (28).

**Reconstruction of Export Production.** We use Baxs and opal to reconstruct variability in export production. The flux to the seabed of Baxs, the fraction of

![Image](https://example.com/image.png)

**Fig. 3.** Iron budget of the equatorial Pacific. (A) Compilation of upwelled Fe fluxes (using Fe concentration data from refs. 26 and 48 and vertical velocities from ref. 49; box model results from ref. 50) and eolian Fe fluxes [aerosol data from ref. 51 and Shank and Johansen (2008)* as cited in ref. 48; for details on core top sediment data compilation, see Supporting Information] illustrating that, over much of the equatorial Pacific, the input of Fe to surface waters from upwelling is much higher than that from eolian input. (B) Time series records of bulk sediment Fe/Th ratios (black) and $^{232}$Th fluxes (red) at site TT013-PC72 over the past 500 kyr. (C) The relationship between Fe/Th ratio and $^{232}$Th fluxes reflects mixing of an eolian component, upwelling Fe from the EUC, and possible influence from PNG. The fit (see Supporting Information for details) requires EUC upwelling Fe fluxes between $117 \pm 7 \mu$mol m$^{-2}$ yr$^{-1}$ [assuming an upper limit (29) of PNG lithogenic $^{232}$Th input of 0.015 $\mu$g m$^{-2}$ ky$^{-1}$, assumed to be constant over the past 500 kyr], and 167 $\pm 8 \mu$mol m$^{-2}$ yr$^{-1}$ (assuming no sediment input from PNG). This range of upwelling Fe supply (gray square in A) is consistent with modern hydrographic estimates of Fe upwelling fluxes.

Ba that is not associated with lithogenic input, has been empirically shown to be strongly related to export production (e.g., refs. 45–47), because barite forms within aggregates of decomposing organic matter. Excess barium was calculated by subtracting the lithogenic Ba from the total Ba concentration using a (Ba/Al)terrestrial ratio of 0.0075 (46). Corrections for the terrigenous fraction are <1.5% at ODP site 849, <2.5% at TT013-PC72, and 3–8% at RNDP74 of the total measured barium in the sediments.

We present new Baxs data from ODP site 849 and integrate these with previously published U/Th data (19), as well as previously published Fe (27), Ba (21), andopal (23) data from site TT013-PC72, and Ba data from RNDP74 (22). Barium at ODP site 849 was measured by inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometry providing digital data from the EB04 cruise (see ref. 26), and Thomas Froelicher for providing upwelling rates extracted from the Geophysical Fluid Dynamics Laboratory (GFDL) model. This work was supported in part by several awards from the US NSF (to G.W. and R.F.A.), S.L.J. was supported by the Swiss National Science Foundation (Grant PP00P2.144811). This is LDEO contribution 7999.

**Reconstruction of Accumulation Rates.** Accumulation rates of sedimentary constituents (Baxs, opal, Fe, 232Th) were calculated using the 230Th method (for more details, see Supporting Information). Baxs is produced in the water column by the decay of 234U at a known and constant rate. Thorium has a short residence time in the water column (20–40 yr); it is adsorbed rapidly to settling particles and deposited in sediments at a rate that is fast relative to the timescale of lateral advection. Its scavenged flux to the seafloor can be assumed to be approximately equal to its known production rate in the overlying water column. Fluxes of sedimentary constituents (e.g., Baxs, opal, Fe, 232Th) were calculated as the product of the concentration of the constituent, [i], and the 230Th-derived mass accumulation rate.

**Statistical Correlation.** Correlations between time series are indicated by Pearson’s correlation coefficient (r).

**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.** We thank Roseanne Schwarzb and Marty Fleisher for assistance in the lab. G.W. thanks Bernd Schwarzb and Augusto Manginib for sharing the elemental and isotope data for RNDP 74. We thank Chris Measures for providing digital data from the EB04 cruise (see ref. 26), and Thomas Froelicher for providing upwelling rates extracted from the Geophysical Fluid Dynamics Laboratory (GFDL) model. This work was supported in part by several awards from the US NSF (to G.W. and R.F.A.). S.L.J. was supported by the Swiss National Science Foundation (Grant PP00P2.144811). This is LDEO contribution 7999.


Supporting Information

Winckler et al. 10.1073/pnas.1600616113

SI Results and Discussion

Reconstruction of Export Production Using Opal and Ba\textsubscript{es} Fluxes. The correlation between fluxes of opal and Ba\textsubscript{es} at TT013-PC72 supports their use as proxies for export production (Fig. S1). Opal and Ba\textsubscript{es} preservation in sediments is most sensitive to different environmental variables (temperature and redox conditions, respectively), so the internal consistency indicates that neither record has been compromised by variable preservation. Finding some scatter in the relationship is not surprising, considering that some export of organic matter, the decomposition of which regulates the formation of barite in the thermocline, is supported by phytoplankton taxa other than diatoms. Furthermore, variable silicification of diatoms under different environmental conditions may also have contributed to the observed scatter, but the overall good correlation indicates that variable silicification was a secondary factor influencing the opal flux record, if it occurred at all. Although there is no direct proxy to constrain past changes in silicification, indirect evidence supports the view that it was minimal, if it occurred at all. Warnock et al. (52) found no glacial–interglacial change in diatom preservation in eastern equatorial Pacific sediments. One would expect diatom preservation to vary with silicification (positive correlation). The absence of any change in preservation argues against changes in silicification. Similarly, Bradtmiller et al. (53) showed that Pa/Th ratios are generally correlated with opal flux in the equatorial Pacific sediment downcore records. This is expected, due to the dominant role played by opal in scavenging Pa in seawater. In other words, the observed scatter may be due to the variable contribution of diatom preservation, if it occurred at all.

One would expect diatom preservation to vary with silicification (positive correlation). The absence of any change in preservation argues against changes in silicification. Similarly, Bradtmiller et al. (53) showed that Pa/Th ratios are generally correlated with opal flux in the equatorial Pacific sediment downcore records. This is expected, due to the dominant role played by opal in scavenging Pa in seawater. In other words, the observed scatter may be due to the variable contribution of diatom preservation, if it occurred at all.

We conclude that the opal flux record is not primarily influenced by variable flux of opal and Ba\textsubscript{es} in the equatorial Pacific sediment downcore records. This is expected, due to the dominant role played by opal in scavenging Pa in seawater. In other words, the observed scatter may be due to the variable contribution of diatom preservation, if it occurred at all.

Eolian iron input. We assess the atmospheric input of dissolved Fe to the equatorial Pacific surface ocean following three independent approaches: First, Shank and Johansen (2008)* analyzed aerosol filters, collected during the EUCFe2006 cruise, and estimated a dissolved Fe flux from dust of 6.6 μmol·m\textsuperscript{-2}·y\textsuperscript{-1} averaged across the 150°E to 140°W section of the equatorial Pacific. Second, we compiled published thorium-based dust flux estimates from sediment core tops across the equatorial Pacific. Assuming a Fe/Th ratio of 5271 wt%/wt% (28) and an iron solubility of 6 ± 0.9% [determined from aerosol measurements from 4°N to 4°S from P16 cruise, cited after Kaupp et al. (26)], we estimate dissolved Fe input from eolian dust deposition of about 4–6 μmol·m\textsuperscript{-2}·y\textsuperscript{-1} east of 160°W, and 11–22 μmol·m\textsuperscript{-2}·y\textsuperscript{-1} in the western equatorial Pacific. This is consistent with modern iron flux estimates of 3.3 μmol·m\textsuperscript{-2}·y\textsuperscript{-1} for 1981–1987 from the only aerosol station in the low-latitude Pacific on Fanning Island, located in the western equatorial Pacific [160°W, 3.9°N (51)]. The agreement between the ship aerosol analysis, the aerosol land station, and the core top-based reconstructions (from a variety of cores and laboratories) is very good, particularly when considering that these analyses integrate over very different timescales.

Comparing upwelling iron fluxes with eolian iron fluxes. Across the equatorial Pacific from 160°E to 110°W, the Fe contribution from upwelling is consistently much higher than eolian-derived iron contributions, indicating that upwelling from the EUC is the principal source of iron to the surface waters of the equatorial Pacific. The difference between the two sources is highest in the middle section of the transect (160°W to 115°W) where the upwelling Fe flux is 20 to >100 times higher than the eolian contribution.

In the western (160°E) and eastern (110°W) equatorial Pacific, the relative difference is somewhat smaller, but upwelling fluxes remain about a factor of 7–10 higher than eolian input. We note that, in the eastern equatorial Pacific, between 115°W and 110°W, Fe concentrations drop off relatively abruptly. We do not have an extended data set for dissolved Fe east of 110°W to explore the iron budget. However, we note that the flux of dust to the equator at ~86.5°W, evaluated using an approach similar

Winckler et al. 2016.113
to that used here, is about 3 times greater than the flux we determine at 140°W (41). If the trend of eastward decreasing dissolved Fe concentrations shown in Fig. S3 continues eastward, then dust may supply an increasing portion of the total Fe available to phytoplankton. We suggest that additional constraints are needed in the easternmost part of the equatorial Pacific to assess the role of ice age dust in regulating the productivity of the ecosystem in that region.

Iron sources constrained by sediment composition. As shown in Fig. 3 B and C, the Fe/Th ratios measured at core site TT013-PC72 are closely correlated to the 232Th flux (Fig. 3B) over the past 500 ky and show cyclical variability between low Fe/Th ratios at 232Th flux maxima (glacial conditions) and high Fe/Th ratios at 232Th minima (interglacial conditions). Measured Fe/Th ratios at times of maximum dust flux approach average for average UCC (3,271), which is expected if the main source of dust to this site is from East Asia (29, 55). Therefore, some source other than Asian dust must supply a major portion of the Fe accumulating in these sediments, and the proportional contribution from the other source(s) must be greater during interglacial periods of minimum dust supply.

One possibility is that all of the nondust Fe is delivered as dissolved Fe transported by the EUC. The other end-member situation is that sediment with a much greater Fe/Th ratio is delivered to the site by the EUC (or by other currents). Sediment from PNG is a likely candidate, both because of its high Fe/Th ratio (~20,000 (29, 56, 57)) and because transport of PNG sediment to the site of TT013-PC72 would be facilitated by the same EUC system that delivers dissolved Fe. Although PNG has the required high Fe/Th ratio, a simple mass balance based on Nd isotopes informs us that the nondust Fe cannot be entirely associated with PNG sediment. As shown by Ziegler et al. (29), the maximum contribution of PNG sources to the total lithogenic material in TT013-PC72 is ~30% during interglacials and much less during glacials. This can be derived using the Nd isotopic composition of PNG sediment (εNd ~7) and that of Asian dust sources (εNd ~10), the likely source of eolian material delivered to the core site. Further considering that PNG sediment and Asian dust have similar Nd concentrations (~30 ppm), the measured isotopic composition of lithogenic material in TT013-PC72 (εNd ~5) allows a maximum contribution of 30% PNG sediment during interglacials, and less during glacials.

Assuming that up to three principal sources (dust, PNG sediment, and dissolved Fe carried by the EUC) deliver Fe and Th to the sediments at the site of TT013-PC72, we use the least squares fit to the relationship between bulk sediment Fe/Th ratio and 230Th-normalized 232Th flux (Fig. 3C) to constrain the supply of dissolved Fe carried by the EUC as well as the Fe/Th ratio of the dust source. We evaluate these parameters for two end-member situations: one for which there is no supply of PNG sediment and one for which the supply of PNG sediment is constant through time and equivalent to 30% of the total supply of lithogenic material during interglacials (an upper limit; see above and ref. 29). In each case, the relationship has the form \( Y = AX + B \), where \( Y \) is the bulk sediment Fe/Th ratio and \( B \) is the Fe/Th ratio of dust.

In the first case, with no PNG sediment and further assuming no significant supply of dissolved Th by the EUC, we have

\[
\frac{\text{Fe}}{\text{Th}}_{\text{bulk-sediment}} = \left( \frac{\text{Fe}_{\text{EUC}} + \text{Fe}_{\text{dust}}}{\text{F}_{\text{Th}}_{\text{dust}}} \right) + \left( \frac{\text{Fe}}{\text{Th}}_{\text{dust}} \right).
\]

Here, \( F \) refers to flux to the core site and \( A \) is the supply of dissolved Fe by the EUC \( (F_{\text{Fe-EUC}}) \), which is estimated from the least squares fit to be 167 ± 8 μmol·m⁻²·y⁻¹.

In the second case, assuming no supply of dissolved Th by the EUC and a constant source of PNG sediment, equivalent to 30% of the total interglacial supply of lithogenic material to the site of TT013-PC72, the mass balance is

\[
\frac{\text{Fe}}{\text{Th}}_{\text{bulk-sediment}} = \left( \frac{\text{Fe}_{\text{EUC}} + \text{Fe}_{\text{PNG}} + \text{Fe}_{\text{dust}}}{\text{F}_{\text{Th}}_{\text{PNG}} + \text{F}_{\text{Th}}_{\text{dust}}} \right).
\]

Rearranging the right-hand side yields

\[
\frac{\text{Fe}}{\text{Th}}_{\text{bulk-sediment}} = \frac{\text{Fe}_{\text{EUC}} + \text{Fe}_{\text{PNG}} + \text{Fe}_{\text{dust}}}{\text{F}_{\text{Th}}_{\text{PNG}} + \text{F}_{\text{Th}}_{\text{dust}}}.
\]

Again, the form of the equation is \( Y = AX + B \), where \( A = \left( \frac{\text{Fe}}{\text{Th}}_{\text{EUC}} + \text{Fe}_{\text{PNG}} \right) \left( \frac{\text{Fe}}{\text{Th}}_{\text{PNG}} \right) - \left( \frac{\text{Fe}}{\text{Th}}_{\text{dust}} \right) \).

We evaluate the supply of dissolved Fe by the EUC \( (F_{\text{Fe-EUC}}) \) by rearranging the equation above after substituting the numerical values for \( A \) and \( B \) \( \left( \frac{\text{Fe}}{\text{Th}}_{\text{dust}} \right) \) obtained by best fit to the data in Fig. 3C, the value for \( \left( \frac{\text{Fe}}{\text{Th}}_{\text{PNG}} \right) \) ~20,000 (29, 56, 57), and \( F_{\text{Th-PNG}} (0.015 \mu g \cdot m^{-2} \cdot ky^{-1}) \), which is derived assuming a constant flux of PNG sediment equal to 30% of the total interglacial lithogenic supply and a Th content of 3.5 ppm (57). This end member yields a lower limit for the supply of dissolved Fe by the EUC of 117 ± 7 μmol·m⁻²·y⁻¹.

The Fe/Th ratio of the dust end member, implied by the mixing relationship in Fig. 3C, is about half of the UCC average of 3,271 (28), used above to estimate modern eolian iron fluxes.

Our estimate of the low Fe/Th ratio for the dust end member obtained from the statistical fit to the data in Fig. 3C relies on the assumption of a constant supply over time of sediment derived from PNG. Instead, if the supply of PNG sediment to 140°W decreased systematically during glacial periods or on some other climate-related cyclic (e.g., ref. 58), then the estimated Fe/Th ratio of the dust end member would increase accordingly, approaching the UCC value in the absence of any input of PNG sediment. Further work is needed to establish whether the dust delivered to 140°W has a Fe/Th ratio roughly half that of UCC, or if the supply of PNG sediment to 140°W varies systematically with climate, with supply of PNG sediment decreasing, perhaps to negligible levels, during glacial periods. In either case, as noted above, any realistic departure from our assumption of an UCC value for the Fe/Th ratio of dust in estimating the eolian source of Fe to the equatorial Pacific would reduce the width of dust-derived Fe illustrated in Fig. 3A, further widening the gap between Fe supplied by upwelling and Fe delivered by dust. Accordingly, using the UCC ratio for estimating the eolian iron input from core top sediment data (Fig. 3A) provides a conservative upper limit of eolian Fe fluxes.

Reconstruction of Accumulation Rates by Thorium Normalization.

Reconstruction of accumulation rates using the 230Th normalization method. Accumulation rates of sedimentary constituents (Ba, opal, Fe, 232Th) are calculated using the 230Th normalization (59, 60). Thorium-230 is produced in the water column by the decay of 234U at a known and constant rate. Thorium has a short residence time in the water column (20–40 y); it is adsorbed rapidly to settling particles and deposited in sediments at a rate that is fast relative to the timescale of lateral advection. Its scavenged flux to the seafloor can be assumed to be approximately equal to its known production rate in the overlying water column. Sedimentary concentrations of 230Th are therefore inversely proportional to the vertical rain rate of sediments.

The 230Th-normalized mass accumulation rate (MAR) for each sample is
\[ MAR = \frac{\beta \cdot z}{[^{230}Th_{xs}]} \]

where \( \beta \) is the constant \(^{230}\text{Th} \) production rate in seawater, \( z \) is the water depth in meters, and \([^{230}Th_{xs}]\) is the measured \(^{230}\text{Th} \) activity after corrections for \(^{230}\text{Th} \) supported by \(^{238}\text{U} \) in detrital sediments. \(^{230}\text{Th} \) supported by authigenic \(^{238}\text{U} \) precipitated from seawater, and radioactive decay since deposition.

Fluxes of sedimentary constituents (e.g., \( \text{Ba}_{\text{xs}}, \text{opal, Fe, } ^{232}\text{Th} \)) are calculated as the product of the concentration of the constituent, \( [i] \), and the mass accumulation rate,

\[ F = [i] \cdot MAR. \]

Our analysis of \(^{230}\text{Th}_{xs} \)-normalized accumulation rates is limited to proxies in the fine fraction of the sediments, which is not sensitive to the recently reported fractionation of coarse (carbonate) fraction during sediment redistribution (61). We also note that the consistency of correlations (and lack thereof) across the equatorial Pacific illustrates that this is not a specific effect at any one site but a consistent pattern observed across varying regimes of the entire tropical Pacific.

The \(^{230}\text{Th}_{xs} \) normalization method offers several advantages over stratigraphic accumulation rates (59, 60), which rely on the mass of sediment accumulated between age control points. Most significantly, the \(^{230}\text{Th}_{xs} \) normalization method corrects for syn-depositional redistribution of sediment by deep-sea currents (sediment focusing). The method does not require knowledge of in situ sediment density, and it is relatively insensitive to small (few kiloyears) errors in age control points. Lastly, the \(^{230}\text{Th}_{xs} \) normalization method allows the evaluation of preserved sediment flux at every sample depth, in contrast to the stratigraphic accumulation method, which provides average accumulation rates between each pair of age control points.

### Comparison with stratigraphy-derived results

Our \(^{230}\text{Th} \)-normalized results are inconsistent with previous work inferring large maxima in export production during peak glacial conditions based on stratigraphic \( \text{Ba}_{\text{xs}} \) and barite) bulk MARs (BMARs) (6), i.e., accumulation rates derived from linear sedimentation rates calculated between \( \delta^{18}\text{O} \)-dated depth horizons. We reproduce pronounced changes in stratigraphy-based \( \text{Ba}_{\text{xs}} \) fluxes at all three sites (Fig. S5), similar to the previously reported results at TTN013-PC72 (6). We also find that the \( \text{Ba}_{\text{xs}} \) BMARs are strongly correlated to stratigraphic \(^{232}\text{Th} \) BMARs (for scatter plots, see Fig. S2 D–F). However, these correlations disappear when the proxy concentrations are normalized to \(^{230}\text{Th}_{xs} \) (Fig. 2 and Fig. S2 A–C), and there is consistently no correlation between export production and dust input. Similarly, strong links between opal BMAR and iron BMAR have been inferred (13) based on stratigraphic mass accumulation rates (BMARs, Figs. S4E and S6B). The correlation disappears when opal and iron are normalized to \(^{230}\text{Th} \) (Figs. S4B and S6D).

We hypothesize that the correlation between the stratigraphic accumulation rates of \( \text{Ba}_{\text{xs}} \) and \(^{232}\text{Th} \) (Fig. S2 D–F), as well as the correlation between the stratigraphic accumulation rates of iron and opal (Fig. S4E), is related to a combination of the following potential artifacts: First, because \( \text{CaCO}_3 \) is the main phase in these sediments and controls the concentrations of all other phases, including opal, Fe, \(^{232}\text{Th} \), Ba, and \(^{230}\text{Th}_x \) (Figs. S6C and S7, and scatter plots in Fig. S8), variable dilution by \( \text{CaCO}_3 \) may lead to apparent correlations. Second, maxima in stratigraphy-derived \( \text{Ba}_{\text{xs}} \) and \(^{232}\text{Th} \) BMARs, as well as in Fe and opal BMARs, correspond to \( \text{CaCO}_3 \) minima (Fig. S6). Loss of \( \text{CaCO}_3 \) by dissolution may impose systematic errors on the \( \delta^{18}\text{O} \)-derived age model whereby the apparent duration of \( \text{CaCO}_3 \) poor intervals is artificially shortened by the loss of foraminifera deposited during those periods, thus creating an erroneously large apparent BMAR. A third potential factor is climate-related variability in sediment redistribution (e.g., refs. 60, 62, and 63).

Normalizing the proxy data to \(^{230}\text{Th}_{xs} \) avoids artifacts related to carbonate dissolution and correctly represents vertical fluxes that may have been modified by sediment redistribution.

![Fig. S1.](https://www.pnas.org/cgi/content/short/1600616113) Correlation between the \(^{230}\text{Th} \)-normalized accumulation rate of excess Ba and opal at the central equatorial Pacific site, T7013-PC72. The accumulation rate of excess barium follows closely the accumulation rate of opal over the past 500 ky, indicated by a correlation factor of \( r = 0.7 \; (p < 0.001) \). The internal consistency, despite differing sensitivity of the preservation of \( \text{Ba}_{\text{xs}} \) and opal to deep-sea environmental conditions, supports their use as proxies for export production.
Fig. S2. Correlations between excess barium and dust at the three locations (A and D, ODP 849; B and E, TT013-PC72; and C and F, RNDP 74) using $^{230}$Th$_{ex}$-normalized accumulation rates (A–C) and stratigraphic accumulation rates (D–F). No significant correlations between export production and dust flux are observed in $^{230}$Th$_{ex}$-normalized rates (A–C). Positive correlations observed for stratigraphic rates (D–F) are due to artifacts related to some combination of carbonate dissolution, sediment redistribution, or errors in age models.
Fig. 53. (A) Zonal section of dissolved iron concentrations along the equator from 150°E to 110°W [data from Slemons et al. (48) and Kaupp et al. (26)]. (B) Averaged Fe concentrations (50–100 m), with the errors representing the SD of the data. (C) Vertical velocities (averaged over 30–80 m) from GFDL ESM2M model (49), averaged over a 1° and a 2° meridional band. Upwelling rates are about a factor of 2–4 lower in the western equatorial Pacific than in the eastern equatorial Pacific, with the west–east gradient being more pronounced closer to the equator (1° band) than in the 2° meridional band.
Fig. S4. Correlation between iron and opal, and their accumulation rates at the central equatorial Pacific site TT013-PC72. Iron is highly correlated with opal concentration (A) and calcium carbonate (D). However, $^{230}$Th-normalized opal fluxes are not correlated to iron supply (B). The apparent correlation, observed between the stratigraphic opal and iron accumulation rate (E), is due to artifacts, related to carbonate dissolution and/or sediment redistribution. We do not observe a significant correlation between Fe flux and $\delta^{18}O$ over the past 500 ky (C), in contrast to $^{232}$Th flux (dust proxy) and $\delta^{18}O$ (Fig. 2B). The absence of a correlation between Fe flux and $\delta^{18}O$ indicates a substantial source of Fe that is not associated with dust, which we attribute to supply by upwelling from the EUC.
Fig. S5. Stratigraphic accumulation rates (BMAR) of excess barium (blue) and dust (red) for the three sites: (A) ODP 849, (B) TT013-PC72, and (C) RNDP 74. The oxygen isotope records (black lines, y axis not reversed) are included for reference. Stratigraphic Ba\textsubscript{ex} accumulation rates are strongly correlated to stratigraphic dust accumulation rates but not to the climate signal. Correlation factors are indicated in each panel, all $P < 0.001$. The apparent correlations may be related to a combination of the following potential artifacts: (i) variable dilution by CaCO\textsubscript{3}, the main phase in the sediments; (ii) the effect of the loss of CaCO\textsubscript{3} by dissolution on $\delta^{18}$O-derived age models (e.g., by apparently shortening the duration of CaCO\textsubscript{3}-poor intervals); and (iii) variability in sediment redistribution.
Fig. S6. Iron and opal records from the central equatorial Pacific site TT013-PC72. (A) The $^{230}$Th$_{xs}$-normalized accumulation rates of iron (red, Fe data from ref. 27) and opal (dark yellow, from ref. 23). (B) Stratigraphic mass accumulation rates (BMAR, open symbols) of iron (27) and opal (23). (A and B) Correlation coefficients of accumulation rate time series are indicated. (C) Iron concentration (red, from ref. 27) and opal concentration (dark yellow, from ref. 23, left y axis) vs. calcium carbonate content (black, right y axis, reversed scale). Correlation coefficients of opal (dark yellow) and iron concentrations (red) with CaCO$_3$ content are given.

Fig. S7. Time series of Ba$_{xs}$ (blue) and $^{232}$Th (red) at the central equatorial Pacific site TT013-PC72. The concentrations of $^{232}$Th and Ba$_{xs}$ are dominated by dilution with calcium carbonate (as are all other sedimentary constituents). By normalizing the proxies for dust and for productivity to $^{230}$Th, we correct for the variable dilution with CaCO$_3$ and can then compare meaningful fluxes of these components.
Fig. S8. Correlation between sedimentary constituents and calcium carbonate, the dominant component of the sediments, at the central equatorial Pacific site, TTN013-PC72. (A) Fe, (B) opal, (C) $^{230}$Th, (D) $^{232}$Th, and (E) Ba$_{xs}$, respectively, vs. CaCO$_3$. All components are highly correlated with CaCO$_3$ (see correlation factors, all $P < 0.001$), indicating that dilution by variable calcium carbonate preservation is the primary control on the concentration of all components, including lithogenic ($^{232}$Th), biogenic (opal, Ba$_{xs}$), and authigenic ($^{230}$Th$_{xs}$, decay corrected to time of deposition) constituents as well as iron, which is supplied from multiple sources.

Table S1. Core locations and data sources

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Core</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Age model</th>
<th>$\delta^{18}$O*</th>
<th>U/Th isotopes</th>
<th>Ba$_{xs}$</th>
<th>Opal</th>
<th>Fe</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ODP 849 (3,839 m)</td>
<td>0.2°N,110.5°W</td>
<td>(64)</td>
<td>(64)</td>
<td>(19)</td>
<td>n/a§</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TT013-PC72 (4,298 m)</td>
<td>0.1°N,139.4°W</td>
<td>(27)$^\dagger$</td>
<td>(21) (19, 20, 65)</td>
<td>(21) (23)</td>
<td>(27)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RNDP74 (2,547 m)</td>
<td>0.3°N,159.3°W</td>
<td>(22)</td>
<td>(22)</td>
<td>(22)$^\dagger$</td>
<td>n/a n/a</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Oxygen isotope records of cores ODP849 and TT013-PC72 are from benthic foraminifera; the oxygen isotope record of RNDP74 is measured on planktonic foraminifera.

$^\dagger$Age model of the upper 100 cm is based on $^{14}$C AMS dating (10).

$^\dagger$U/Th data were collected in samples older than 166 ky by $\alpha$-spectrometry (22) but are not reported here because uncertainties become too large.

§Not available.